

5. What solutions do you believe are available to resolve this issue?

## Handout B: Immigration in the Gilded Age and Progressive Era Answer Key

- Challenges faced by immigrants include the following:
  - Long, difficult journey by sea
  - Uprooting, leaving home, and moving to a completely new land
  - Financial difficulties of providing for passage to the United States and establishing a new life
  - Difficulties in assimilation, blending cultures often led to racial and ethnic tensions
  - Difficulties in finding work to support new life
- Push factors tend to be negative events and circumstances in one's home country that "push" them from the country such as slow economic growth and religious persecution. Pull factors are those things which entice immigrants to come to one country as they leave their home country. Pull factors act as incentives as they draw people such as the access to cheap, farmable land and industrial jobs in the United States. Push and Pull factors work in tandem to draw people from one country to another.
- With the large number of immigrants beginning to enter the country, the U.S. government developed a formalized process for vetting immigrants. Ellis and Angel Islands became the point of entry to the country where immigrants would have their documents checked and be subject to a medical examination before being allowed into the country. These processes were intended to ensure that those desiring to immigrate were not carrying foreign disease or illness that could pose a risk to U.S. citizens or that they were arriving illegitimately.
- As strangers in a foreign land, familial and cultural groups provided support and comfort for those who had left their homes. Additionally, these cultural groups allowed for immigrants to maintain their distinct customs and traditions alive: festivals, native language newspapers, and religious observances. All of these helped to ease the process of assimilation.
- Tension arose from two main sources: the first was competition over jobs. Often times both skilled and unskilled immigrants were seen as cheaper sources of labor. Often times, foreign workers were willing to take high-risk, low-pay jobs at a rate that was difficult to compete with. Secondly, there were general fears of the unknown as relating to foreign culture and customs. These fears were often perpetuated by myths and propaganda that would contribute to nativism's rise as a political movement. Many worried that it would be difficult to uphold a democratic society when introducing peoples and cultures who had differing ideas of fundamental principles such as the rule of law, private property, and individual liberty.
- Responses may vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Some examples include:

- Cultural diversity: new customs, foods, music, etc.
  - Unique skills and talents
  - Labor for jobs many were unwilling to take
7. Responses may vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Students may list some of the following as potential challenges faced:
- Blending cultures was not always successful and sometimes ideas from one culture might clash with the founding principles of the United States.
  - Foreign cultures may not agree with principles seen as fundamental to American government: rule of law, private property, and individual liberty.
  - Tensions, resulting from labor competition and fear, between national born citizens and immigrants that must be mitigated.
  - Students may also offer various examples of ways in which the United States has helped to ease the tensions and challenges faced by immigration.

## Handouts C, D, E: Critical Thinking Questions Answer Key

1. Main points of Henry Cabot Lodge's argument in his Senate speech include:
  - The passage of a literacy test would be not only fair, but effective and beneficial in its results.
  - Unlimited introduction of cheap foreign labor is the greatest contributor to wage reduction which injures American workers who cannot compete with foreign labor. Skilled workers are not at as high of a risk, but low-skill workers are in grave danger.
  - Immigration poses threats to American citizenship that are far greater than the economic threats.
  - The blending of races and cultures with different traditions and beliefs threatens the mental and moral qualities of the United States.
  - If immigration is not going to be entirely stopped, it is necessary to institute strong checks to guard our nation from unrestricted immigration.
2. The basis of Lodge's fears is rooted in the idea that there are inherent risks when blending the various "traditions and inheritances," of other cultures "whose thoughts and whose beliefs are wholly alien to ours, and with whom we have never assimilated or even been associated in the past." Lodge fears that this blending will threaten the principles on which the United States was founded.
3. Lodge asserts that there is an "appalling danger...from the flood of low, unskilled, ignorant, foreign labor...." Lodge fears that these type of immigrants not only harm the country economically by driving down wages for unskilled labor and taking jobs from American citizens, but also harm the foundation of American society and citizenship.

4. Students' responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Ensure that students use proper evidence to support their claim.
5. The central issue for Lodge's argument is that unchecked and unfiltered immigration is a risk to American society, economically and culturally.
6. Main points of Cleveland's veto message include the following:
  - The proposed literacy test is a radical departure from current national immigration policy.
  - Current immigration policy should not be changed without apparent disadvantages. If it is to be replaced, the replacement ought to be more adequate, free from uncertainty, and guarded against difficult or oppressive administration.
  - Those immigrants which could have once been deemed as undesirable are now some of the finest citizens of the United States.
  - Not all cities are overpopulated by immigrants, and even in cities where overpopulation may exist, it is likely not permanent enough to warrant changing immigration policy.
  - Economic hardships are not the result of immigration, but the result of business depression and stagnation.
  - "Those most willing and best entitled ought to be able to secure the advantages of such work as there is to do...."
  - Immigration changes are only needed to protect the population from turbulence and disorder.
  - A literacy test would not be an effective method of restricting immigration even if it were implemented.
7. Cleveland ultimately vetoes the legislation stating that based upon its stated and un-stated provisions, it is unnecessarily harsh and oppressive. Its poor construction would cause vexation and its operation would harm, citizens.
8. Accept well-reasoned comparisons based on the two documents; Students may note some of the following areas of disagreement:
  - Lodge believes that the flood of immigration is harmful to American society while Cleveland believe that it has been nothing but beneficial.
  - Lodge believes that immigrant workers who are willing to work in unskilled labor for low wages are harming the earnings of unskilled American workers. Cleveland states that low earnings are the result of business depression and stagnation. Additionally, those most willing and best entitled to work ought to have the ability to do so.
  - Lodge believes that the literacy test would be fair and effective while Cleveland asserts that it is not only oppressive and harsh, but also ineffective.

9. The central argument of Cleveland's veto message is that immigration has not been bad for the country as the literacy test legislation would suggest. Current immigration policy does not need to be implemented. Furthermore, the literacy test legislation is unnecessary, oppressive, and would be ineffective if enacted.
10. Yes, Cleveland does not agree with Lodge that immigration is essentially a risk to the nation. Cleveland believes that immigration has been and will likely continue to be beneficial for the United States, a nation essentially founded on immigration.
11. Students may give varied answers as to areas where the two men may agree, accept well-reasoned responses. Students may list things such as the following:
  - Both men agree that protecting the United States is important, even though they disagree on whether or not immigration is currently a risk to American interests.
  - Both men agree that there are some economic issues effecting American workers even though they disagree on the factors contributing to these issues.

## Handout G: Class Discussion Questions Answer Key

1. Student responses will vary depending on the direction of your class discussion. Encourage your students to select relevant portions directly from the texts in order to elaborate on discussed themes.
2. In 1890, there would have been fewer immigrants from the different nations than there was in 1910. Therefore, in addition to the reduction from 3% to 2% this would have severely lowered the number of allowed immigrants in the United States.
3. Students' responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses.
4. Students' responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Some examples of similar themes are as follows:
  - As Lodge had stated, Coolidge also believes that unchecked immigration is a threat to American society and that only those who can be absorbed into what Coolidge refers to as, "the ranks of good citizenship."
  - Coolidge states that, "Those' who do not want to be partakers of the American spirit ought not to settle in America." This is reminiscent of Lodge's assertion that those immigrants which are not a threat are those who are well educated, skilled, have an establish position, and desire to contribute to American society.
  - Coolidge and Cleveland would have disagreed on immigration policy, as Cleveland did not think that restricting immigration was necessary.
5. Coolidge's major themes in support of immigration reform include the following:

- New arrivals should be limited to the capacity of the country to help properly integrate them into, “the ranks of good citizenship.”
  - Restricting immigration ensures that those most deserving and most capable of becoming good citizens are admitted into the country.
6. Students’ responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Some examples include:
- For current American citizens, increased immigration restriction would have been seen as positive, lessening some of the resentment felt by current citizens towards immigrants.
  - For current and recent immigrants, the sudden restriction of immigration could have been seen as unnecessary and unfair. This would have angered immigrant families, increasing the tensions between current citizens and immigrants.
7. Students’ responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses.
8. Students’ responses will vary; accept well-reasoned responses. Some examples of responses include:
- Economic growth during a time of moderate to heavy immigration may have begun to change the mindset of some regarding immigration. As the economy experienced explosive growth, some may have seen that there were benefits to immigration that all could experience.
  - In contrast, some may have seen the period of explosive economic growth following tighter immigration restrictions. These individuals would have potentially seen the economic growth as a result of the U.S. Government restricting immigration. This could lead them to conclude that restrictive immigration was better for the economy than open immigration.