

## Handout A: Workers in the Gilded Age Answer Key

1. While the individual labor unions had varying objectives, they all advocated better pay, shorter hours, and better conditions for workers. Owners and managers wanted maximum efficiency and effort from each worker, while keeping costs down to promote the profit that incentivized them to run a business in the first place. Students might suggest that a process focused on civil discourse to facilitate a compromise between the goals of workers and management might be best to meet the needs of both groups.
2. Workers gave up their individual freedom of contract, delegating that power to the union. The trade-off was that they gained power in numbers. The manager of a factory could fire and replace troublesome workers one at a time, but the union members hoped that management could not face the prospect of all workers, unified, walking out at the same time to go on strike. They did not gain improved wages, hours, or working conditions in the short term, as most strikes of the era failed. But in the long term they achieved some of their goals through persistence and their increasing political voice.
3. Unskilled workers were easily replaceable, received lower wages, and were more likely to be laid off in economic downturns. Skilled workers had indispensable abilities that employers desperately needed and could not easily replace. They received higher pay and enjoyed better working conditions than unskilled workers, and had the leverage necessary to bargain for improved benefits.
4. More jobs were available for middle-class professional and white collar clerical jobs such as teachers, accountants, nurses, secretaries and managers.
5. The main labor unions in America during the Gilded Age and Progressive Era were
  - A. Amalgamated Association of Iron, Steel, and Tin Workers (unsuccessful strike at Homestead weakened their reputation)
  - B. American Railway Union (unsuccessful Pullman Strike weakened their reputation)
  - C. Knights of Labor (advocated visionary social & economic reform; diverse membership was divided in goals; welcomed unskilled workers who were easily replaced)
  - D. Industrial Workers of the World (founded on a communist philosophy that sought the violent overthrow of capitalism; too radical for most Americans)
  - E. American Federation of Labor (adopted a balanced approach, “business unionism,” that favored long-term success—a focus on higher pay and lower hours)
  - F. United Mine Workers (achieved only very limited success in 1902 anthracite coal strike when the President Theodore Roosevelt intervened to force arbitration)

Of these, the American Federation of Labor seemed to be most successful as Gompers kept the goals simple and focused on objectives that all workers could support: more pay, shorter hours, and better working conditions. Knights of Labor and IWW were probably the least successful (Accept well-reasoned responses).

6. These Supreme Court decisions, and the degree to which they reflected progressive influence, are described in the essay.
- A. *Adair v. U.S.* (1895) The Supreme Court endorsed the principle of liberty of contract, meaning that employers could fire a worker for any reason, and a worker could decide to leave a job for any reason. This decision is consistent with a limited role for the federal government in the economy and does not reflect influence of Progressives.
  - B. *Lochner v. New York* (1905) The Supreme Court overturned a New York law limiting the number of hours bakers could work. The majority opinion asserted that the right to liberty of contract invalidated the state law. Progressives criticized the decision as an example of a Social Darwinist court defending a laissez-faire system; others saw it as an example of support for classical liberal principles such as limited government.
  - C. *Muller v. Oregon* (1908) The Supreme Court majority upheld the state law's limits on women's working hours because of the belief that "woman's physical structure and the performance of maternal functions place her at a disadvantage in the struggle for subsistence." Louis Brandeis's brief filed in the case was based on a lengthy summary of social science research. This decision is consistent with the Progressives' approach, a more active role for government in regulating the economy. It also reflects the principle of federalism, in that the Supreme Court affirmed a state's power to legislate for itself.
  - D. *Bunting v. Oregon* (1917) The Supreme Court upheld a state law that limited all Oregon factory workers to ten hours a day. This decision is consistent with the Progressives' approach, a more active role for government in regulating the economy. It also reflects the principle of federalism, in that the Supreme Court affirmed a state's power to legislate for itself.
  - E. *Hammer v. Dagenhart* (1918) The 1916 Keating-Owen Child Labor Act banned the shipment across state lines of goods made in factories which employed children under the age of fourteen, but the Supreme Court ruled this law unconstitutional in *Hammer v. Dagenhart* (1918). The Court's majority held that Congress had overstepped its constitutional power in attempting to regulate the production of goods. This decision is consistent with a limited role for the federal government in the economy and does not reflect influence of Progressives.
7. In what ways was the outlook and agenda of Progressives in tension with the Founders' approach to the proper role of government?

The Founders believed the people should restrict the U.S. government's power to those enumerated functions listed in the U.S. Constitution, in order to protect the life, liberty, and property of individuals. Skeptical of a powerful central government and alert to the tendency of humans and institutions to abuse power, they structured the U.S. Constitution to create a system of limited and divided powers. They believed that people's inherent self-interest would lead officials to check one another's attempts to exercise more power than the Constitution allows. By contrast, Progressives believed that government at all levels should be empowered to apply the work of experts to solve the problems of the modern world. Unlike the Framers of the Constitution, Progressives believed

that man's nature can and should be bettered by enlightened rulers. Therefore, they believed the people should enhance the U.S. government's power to solve social and economic problems in order to improve themselves through government-sponsored programs and policies.

8. What actions show the influence of progressivism and support for the labor movement following 1900?

In the early twentieth century, state governments passed laws regulating labor conditions such as limiting the number of hours employees could work, and the labor of women and children. They believed government should be empowered to solve the problems of the modern industrial era. The law reflected the increasing influence of progressives as government began to intervene on the side of organized labor to regulate the economy. Examples were President Theodore Roosevelt's intervention in the 1902 anthracite coal strike, the 1913 creation of a presidential cabinet-level Department of Labor, the 1914 Clayton Anti-trust Act, the 1916 Adamson Act, and the 1916 Keating-Owen Child Labor Act, as well as the creation of the National War Labor Board during World War I.

9. What is welfare capitalism, and how did it change the expectations that workers held with respect to their jobs?

In "welfare capitalism," employers gave workers higher pay and other benefits to quell the appeal of labor unions. It changed workers' expectations because they were no longer as likely to need to fight for certain benefits at work, and businesses could use these benefits as a way to attract the most qualified workers.

## Handout B: Haymarket Riot Answer Key

1. Given the list of constitutional principles at the beginning of the lesson, students may find various examples of relevant principles for this incident. Responses may include some of the following:  
  
Freedom of Assembly- The strikers had a right to assemble and protest that was violated when the police force violently attempted to disperse the crowds. They also had the right to assemble peacefully to protest the police violence prior to the bomb throwing.  
  
Inalienable rights, rule of law, and due process- all were violated when Judge Joseph Gary conducted the trial of the Anarchists with little concern for due process.  
  
Checks and balances- despite the improperly handed-down sentences, Illinois Governor John Peter Altgeld pardoned the remaining three defendants.
2. Many workers, especially immigrant workers, were upset by the difficult working conditions which often included 10-12 hour work days. Additionally, economic downturn was leaving many without work, a circumstance which encouraged the use of Strikebreakers who were willing to work in conditions being protested by strikers. Following the violence that occurred at the McCormick Harvesting Machine Company, many began to become frustrated with the use of violence by police in dispersing the protest. This frustration would escalate into the incident that would result in the

death and injury of many. Furthermore, tensions with immigrants would lead to violations of due process during the trial of those accused of being anarchists in relation to the Haymarket Square Riot.

3. Workers began to strike in an effort to demand greater working conditions. When their strike was met with violence from the police, they gathered to protest the use of force that resulted in death during the strike. However, this protest led to violence. While peacefully assembling to protest has great potential for success, each time the incidents turned to violence, a method which is not successful in bringing about social change.

4. Student responses may vary. Students may describe some of the following:

First Amendment protection of Assembly- the workers had a right to both peacefully protest the poor working conditions and the use of police violence when breaking-up the strike.

Fifth Amendment guarantee to due process should have been granted to those accused of being anarchists. While this was not granted during the trial, the presence of checks and balances rectified this through the pardon of the remaining defendants.

## Handout C: Homestead Strike Answer Key

1. Given the list of constitutional principles at the beginning of the lesson, students may find various examples of relevant principles for this incident. Responses may include some of the following:

Freedom of contract- the AA was able to engage in favorable labor contracts following their strikes against Carnegie companies that also made them the strongest labor union in the country. This would later be violated by Frick who would cut wages and then refuse to negotiate further with the Union.

Inalienable rights- these would also be violated by Frick who laid off all workers when they refused to accept the new contract proposed by Frick, who refused to negotiate with the union.

Limited government- the use of the National Guardsmen in order to break up a strike violated the principle of limited government.

Freedom of press- sometimes freedom of press grants an organization to report in such a way that is not entirely accurate. Such was the case as press reports increased public suspicion of labor unions.

2. Many workers turned to labor unions in order to secure their desires in the workplace. However, as labor unions began to grow in their power, they began to secure contracts that, while beneficial to workers and the union, many employers did not fully support. Therefore, companies would look for ways to make strong stands against the unions. In this instance specifically, Frick would act in such a way that truly harmed workers. In doing so, the tensions between employees and employer were exacerbated to the point of striking and violence that would be defended by armed guards and the National Guard.

3. Initially, social change was sought through the power of the Unions, a highly effective method, especially in this era. However, when Frick refused to cooperate, workers sought to enact change through striking. Doing so peacefully can be an effective way of bringing about change. However, in this instance, Frick was able to replace all of the employees with strikebreakers. Eventually, violence would erupt between strikers, strikebreakers, Pinkertons, and later the National Guard. This violence would be an ineffective way of bringing social change that would reach its climax when Alexander attempted to assassinate Frick. While this violence remained ineffective, the meeting between the strikers and steel company would prove to be a more effective method of discussing the need for changes and renegotiating.
4. Student responses may vary. Students may describe some of the following:  
First Amendment protection of Assembly- the workers had a right to peacefully protest and strike following the refusal of Frick to negotiate.

## Handout D: Pullman Strike Answer Key

1. Students' responses may vary. Some students may defend Debs, stating that the workers had legitimate grievances and did not actually promote violent actions. Others may say that Debs and other labor leaders should have continued to work and obeyed the orders they were given despite their disagreement and find another way to voice their displeasure. Accept well reasoned responses.
2. Given the list of constitutional principles at the beginning of the lesson, students may find various examples of relevant principles for this incident. Responses may include some of the following:  
Freedom of speech and assembly- in protest of the lowered wages without lowering rent, the workers had constitutional protections to peacefully and constitutionally dispute with the Pullman Company.  
Limited government- President Cleveland's threats to become involved is a violation of limited government. Additionally, Attorney General Richard Olney's issuance of a federal injunction violated this principle.  
Federalism- Governor Altgeld maintains that he can handle the strike at the state level without the need for interference from the national government.  
Due process- Altgeld also recognized that there were legitimate grievances held by the labor unions.  
Checks and balances- the principle of checks and balances were not recognized when the General Managers Association conspired with the U.S. Attorney General in order to obtain an injunction against the strikers.
3. Economic depression and business slowdown were extremely impactful in the lives of workers during this period. While initially fortunate to still have work, increasingly lower wages paired with stagnant rent and expenses led to extreme economic hardship for workers. Workers desired to

secure increased wages or decreased rent in order to make their wages more livable. However, the refusal to cooperate led to conflict with employers.

4. Initially, employees continued working despite the decreased wages in order to provide for their families. However, as wages continued to fall and living expenses did not, workers turned to the formation of a Union in order to seek their needs. While this method had a great possibility for success, the refusal of Pullman management to cooperate with the workers resulted in further strife between workers and management. An initially peaceful strike also had great potential for success. However, when the strikes of workers began to interfere with the U.S. Postal Service, greater issues occurred. The eventual violence that resulted when federal troops were sent to crush the strike would not be an effective method for enacting change, and it would eventually take cooperation on behalf of management, the union, and workers in order to bring about change.
5. Student responses may vary. Students may describe some of the following:

First Amendment protection of Assembly- the workers had a right to peacefully protest and strike following the refusal of Pullman management to negotiate wages and company pricing.

## Handout E: Graphic Organizer Comparing Haymarket, Homestead, and Pullman Incidents Answer Key

	Haymarket Riot, 1886, Chicago	Homestead Strike, 1892, Carnegie Steel Mill, Homestead, PA.	Pullman Strike, 1894, Chicago and other major railroad cities
Management	McCormick Harvesting Machine Company Works	<b>Andrew Carnegie,</b> <b>Henry Clay Frick</b> 30 years after the strike, Carnegie writes in his autobiography that he deeply regrets the use of strikebreakers, pitting one group of poor men against another.	George Pullman; Pullman Company Management; General Managers Association representing management of 24 railroad companies.



	Haymarket Riot, 1886, Chicago	Homestead Strike, 1892, Carnegie Steel Mill, Homestead, PA.	Pullman Strike, 1894, Chicago and other major railroad cities
Workers' Grievances	Demand for 8-hour workday; McCormick management's use of strikebreakers; police violence	Frick cuts wages without cutting rent or other expenses in company town, refuses to recognize union's right to negotiate for workers. Frick closes the plant and calls for strikebreakers, hires Pinkerton agents to protect the plant, and asks for National Guard. Frick runs the plant with strikebreakers.	Workers are fired and wages cut due to economic depression, but rents are not lowered in Pullman company town. Management refuses all worker demands, fires worker leaders, and operates railroads with strikebreakers.
Labor Union	None, though many people associate the violence and disorder with the Knights of Labor, since that union welcomed immigrants and workers of all types.	Amalgamated Association of Iron and Steel Workers (AA)	<b>American Railway Union (Eugene V. Debs)</b> Debs & other union leaders defy the federal injunction to end the strike and are arrested. After federal intervention, Debs realizes the strike is doomed & advises workers to go back to their jobs on management's terms. Debs spends his time in prison studying Karl Marx and then founds the American Socialist Party.

	Haymarket Riot, 1886, Chicago	Homestead Strike, 1892, Carnegie Steel Mill, Homestead, PA.	Pullman Strike, 1894, Chicago and other major railroad cities
Workers' actions	Strikers, many of whom are German immigrants, rally for improved working conditions; later, protest against police violence.	<p>Union refuses the new contract offered by Frick in 1892. 3000 non-union workers agree to strike, supporting the union demands. Rallies and picketing are peaceful.</p> <p>Strike continues a total of 5 months before workers must call off the strike &amp; go back to work on Frick's terms.</p> <p>Steelworkers' union is ultimately destroyed due to its inability to negotiate successfully for workers' needs.</p>	<p>Workers form a committee to negotiate with management, go on strike when management refuses to compromise with them. They refuse to handle Pullman cars, but offer to operate mail trains. Strike spreads across the country, but is peaceful for several months.</p> <p>Workers at first defy federal injunction to return to work, but later the strike collapses and they go back.</p>
Police Action	Try to keep peace between strikers and strikebreakers; order crowd to disperse; beat some of the demonstrators; fire into the crowd, killing one striker & injuring others.	300 Pinkerton agents arrive by barge at midnight.	Pres. Cleveland orders 2000 federal troops into Chicago to stop the strike and restore order, over Gov. Altgeld's objections.



	Haymarket Riot, 1886, Chicago	Homestead Strike, 1892, Carnegie Steel Mill, Homestead, PA.	Pullman Strike, 1894, Chicago and other major railroad cities
Violence	<p>Police beat demonstrators, fire into the crowd.</p> <p>Someone threw a bomb into a group of police officers.</p>	<p>Outnumbered Pinkerton agents battle with townspeople &amp; strikers, resulting in several deaths &amp; other casualties. Frick asks PA governor to send in National Guard to restore order.</p> <p>Alexander Berkman, seeking to support the workers, attempts to assassinate Frick in his office.</p>	<p>Outnumbered Pinkerton agents battle with townspeople &amp; strikers, resulting in several deaths &amp; other casualties. Frick asks PA governor to send in National Guard to restore order.</p> <p>Alexander Berkman, seeking to support the workers, attempts to assassinate Frick in his office.</p>
Legal Action	<p>1886: 8 anarchists, most of whom are German immigrants, are tried. Jury finds defendants guilty of murder. Judge Gary rules that the anarchists had incited the bomb-throwing, in spite of lack of evidence against them, &amp; sentences 7 of them to be executed. One commits suicide; 4 others are hanged.</p>	<p>Over 100 union leaders are arrested and charged with murder of the Pinkertons, though they are eventually acquitted.</p>	<p>The Pullman strike is the first labor uprising in which the federal government uses an injunction to support management.</p> <p>Debs &amp; other union leaders are imprisoned.</p>

	Haymarket Riot, 1886, Chicago	Homestead Strike, 1892, Carnegie Steel Mill, Homestead, PA.	Pullman Strike, 1894, Chicago and other major railroad cities
Public Opinion	Public opinion associates labor unions with violence; turns against labor unions in general and against Knights of Labor specifically, in spite of the fact that Knights of Labor are not directly involved with the McCormick incidents.	Public opinion across the country is sympathetic to the strikers until Berkman's attempt to assassinate Frick. Then, public sympathies shift as people associate the union with disorder and violence.	Labor unions are blamed for cultivating an atmosphere of violence. Labor unions lose members and influence until the 1930s.
Government Action	Gov. Altgeld pardons the surviving prisoners in 1893.	Gov. Pattison sends 8500 National Guardsmen to crush the strike & restore order.	President Cleveland seeks to maintain mail delivery and interstate trade, offers to send troops to Chicago to stop the strike.  Gov. Altgeld, sympathetic with workers, rejects Cleveland's offer.  Federal judges order strikers back to work; strikers refuse, and Cleveland sends in federal troops.